EFL: The Effects of Being English Users on Bahasa Indonesia and Identity

Marcelinus Pascalis Nue
Atma Jaya Catholic University of Indonesia
Email: marcelpascalis95@gmail.com

ABSTRACT
Since most Indonesians have familiarized themselves with English, their views of this language become a discussable issue. This study aimed to investigate Indonesians' perspectives as English users. This study also examined the effects of English on their first language and identity. There were four participants with different social backgrounds selected in this study. They were intensively interviewed by using open-ended questions. By using a qualitative method, the data were classified into types of investment as the themes, such as *identity, capitals* and maneuvering ideology. This study found that the participants' awareness of their investment has sent them to become contextualized English users. Then it would seem to indicate that English would not be the threat, even it could generate some benefits. Eventually, although this study was not within academic contexts, it revealed some pedagogical implications for the development of the language learning process in EFL classrooms.
Keywords: investment, language loyalty, identity construction

INTRODUCTION

English has become the most spoken language which its functions have been employed for many global activities. There are vast amounts of literatures on English use within world society, such as Kachru (1992) has specified English into certain divisions of countries, such as inner circles, outer circles and expanding circles. Further, Crystal (1997) stated that several domains of the English has spread in politics, economics, the press, advertising, broadcasting, motion pictures, popular music, international travel and safety, education and communications areas. Those domains have become interests for scholars to be deeply explored, such as Bolton's (2008) studies on the need of the English speakers with higher proficiency to fulfill the demand of the economic growth in Asia. The needs of using English as an International language are in line with the incessant demand for Bahasa Indonesia as a national language. Different from countries, such as Malaysia and Singapore, which occupy English as a language tool within business and administrative fields, Indonesia have strictly deemed it as only a foreign language. Yet, although Bahasa Indonesia has been greater developed than English, some people could still grab the opportunities to, at least, use English in education and workplace environment. Being capable to acquire English might offer some additional benefits in International scope, especially in the global marketplace.

In relation to the first language and speakers' identity position within EFL contexts, English is often valued as a threat. People argue that English is not merely for communications, yet its penetration into a specific society might potentially replace the existence of the first language and disrupt the shared identity. According to Johnson (2009), second language learners

must automatically learn both the language and its culture. Therefore, whether or not this may cause negative impacts, it definitely depends on the speakers and the language's power. Some may successfully maintain the use of L1 due to their high social status position and the decisive policy. In Indonesia, the motivation and considerations of people to learn and use English emerge reasonably and those may vary for each speaker. Therefore, by mirroring from the Davin and Norton's (2015) language investment theory, this study attempted to examine the effects for becoming English users for Indonesians.

BACKGROUND THEORIES

Language investment

The extensive use of English as the target language in a particular context could be associated with two main aspects, including the speakers' investment to acquire English and the speakers' loyalty towards the minor language. One' efforts to invest in learning a language may generate "a wider range of symbolic and material resources" that could increase their social and cultural values (Davin and Norton, 2015, p. 37). As a result, Davin and Norton collaboratively constructed the investment model that meets three significant points, such as *identity, capital* and *ideology*. Norton mentioned *identity* (2015) as "how a person understands his or her relationship to the world, how that relationship is structured across time and space, and how the person understands possibilities for the future" (Norton, 2013, p.45). This is also seen unstable, because identity is gradually haunted by the contradictions among the natural positions and expectations, the prevalent ideologies and other optional futures, one's feeling of being confined and unlimited opportunities to have imagined identities to retransform their new situations as what they imagine to be (Davin and Norton, 2015). *Ideologies* are "dominant ways of thinking" that enable individuals to define their position to be excluded or included into the more prestigious community as language users (p. 43). *Capital* is viewed as a means in which individuals may use it to maintain, produce, or change their social utterances. The term of capital is divided into three types (Bourdieu, 1986, as cited in Davin and Norton, 2015). Those are economic capital that includes one's income, wealth, property, etc; cultural capital, such as knowledge; and social capital that involves one's connection to target language authentic contexts.

Language loyalty

On the other hand, individuals' preferences towards the investment to learn a target language must have a significant effect on their mother tongue or first language. The most common impacts are the occurrence of language maintenance or language shift among individuals. Fishman (1972a) earlier created a concept on language maintenance and shift which concisely revealed that language maintenance is a shared agreement of individuals loyalty and nationalism, urban people tend to shift than in rural areas, and the less-prestigious languages are mostly replaced by the higher ones. Therefore, he then indicated that language loyalty and language revival to strengthen the use of less-prestigious language and weaken the more prestigious one, occur urban areas.

In EFL contexts, such as Indonesia, individuals are guided by their own motivation to learn and use a certain language, such as English. Motivation are divided into two areas, instrumental motivation- it is related to the language usage as the purpose- and integrative motivation- not only about the language employment, but also the expectation to be integrated with the target language community (Gardner, 1985). In addition, each person has their rights to acquire another language

outside of their language repertoires and to transform their existing identity the new one. Hence, those concepts on language investment and language loyalty could be applied to examine ones' perspectives as the target language users.

Studies on Language and Identity

Language and identity seemed inseparable, because when people are using a certain language, in the same time, it represents particular identities. There are two reasons in which language and identity are interconnected one to another (Le Page & Tabouret-Keller, 1998), because of both human psychology and law. In other words, the process of being individuals who use a language selected and being persons with certain identity occur derivatively in the family, or happen due to its regulations of particular areas. Furthermore, some literatures view that languages are often used to co-construct peoples' identity. Identity is constructed when people from different cultures encounter. Drawing from Norton's (2000) influential case study on immigrant women in Canada, it can be concluded that the investment to use and practice the target language is based on the contexts of the changing identities that include the historical time and social distances (Norton, 2013). By using the data sources from diaries and interviews, the study explored the learners' changing identities, both inside and outside of the classroom. As a result, different construction have affected on their motivation to learn and use the target language.

A more recent study by Lee Su Kim et.al (2010) has investigated how English could affect the young Malaysian undergraduates' identities. The results revealed that the respondents have experienced the benefits of being fluent in using English. Those benefits mostly include social benefits, such as the better treatments from the people around them when those participants are speaking English well. Other advantages emerge, e.g. improving their self-esteem and making them look knowledgeable. The author valued that the findings were consistent with Norton's notion on "investment" that language becomes social capital which brings the speakers to be acceptable within society.

In Taiwanese case study, Yeh (2013) pointed out that how EFL speakers build their identity, is generally by applying two models of English employment, called "appropriation and negotiation" (p. 330). Appropriation refers to adapt English based on the nonnatives' contexts of used and varieties, while negotiation pertains to the EFL speakers' awareness towards the needs of intercultural communication. Related to this issue, Yeh conducted her study that aimed at investigating the shifting roles of English for Taiwan EFL learners' identity. She revealed that "through recognizing English native speakers' differences from them, they came to understand more clearly who they themselves were" (p.338). Then she quoted one of her participants, Rong, as saying that "my Taiwanese culture makes me know who I am, even though I have learned English and its culture" (p. 337), though another participant' identity (Yen) tend to be native-like. For instance, the participants have experienced the English existences within their daily lives, will not immediately shift their local identity as Taiwanese. Otherwise, they felt empowered and strengthened to be aware of who they are. On the one hand, the more updated study conducted by Chang (2014), also examined the influence of English also in Taiwan. According to her results of analysis, she found that discovering the English contributions for global matters facilitates people to reflect on their purpose of being proficient in English. Nevertheless, some of her participants conveyed that awareness to find out the reasons why learning English is important.

In short, those studies showed that nonnative speakers in Taiwan have a great defense towards the spread of English there. It indicates that Taiwan EFL students, as a part of society, hold a strong commitment toward their cultures and identity. Instead, one of the Yeh's participants (Rong) argued that all people have the same right to master English as their modal of being "global citizens" (p. 332-334). Nevertheless, those studies seemed lack of domain varieties that related to individual identity preservation. Besides, although those studies seemed concerning on the Taiwanese perspectives towards English use, but they rarely mention whether the sense of nationalism of people (or the participants) is in danger or not.

In Indonesia, the examination of the identity construction on the second generations of immigrants in California, which are Indonesian-Americans, has been done by Lie et.al (2018). Parents' role to introduce the home language (Indonesian) has created positive impacts for the participants. The participants, although their English seemed native-like, they could position themselves as being proud as Indonesians. In this case, the learners' investment to learn and expand Indonesian language and cultures were the keys success to construct their identity as Indonesian.

Those studies that examined the interrelation between language and identity have shown that acquiring and using English may generate positive and negative outcomes. While possessing their abilities to speak English and adopting target cultures, the participants still maintained their native languages, cultures and identity. On the other hand, other participants are in comfort to own and use English. The studies on language and identity would be still developed and the results of above studies may change. In Indonesia, English is only officially a foreign language, but its importance to this country has brought Indonesia to be able joining into global communities. Therefore, this is always necessary to explore Indonesian English users' perspectives, especially in relation to their identities.

METHOD

This study was conducted in an attempt to explore the Indonesians' perspective as English users and their identity. Therefore, by using a qualitative descriptive study, this study specifically aimed to address these following questions:
(1) What does being English users mean to the participant?
(2) What are the impacts of English on Bahasa Indonesia and the users' identity?
It was reasonable to address the questions above by remembering that according to the some literatures I have mentioned, there are correlations between learning and using a foreign language, and the users' identity existences.

Participants

Table 1. Participants' demographic information

Name	Age	Linguistic background	Educational background	Occupation
Tina	23	Indonesian, English, Javanese	Bachelor in an English program	Employee
Sela	23	Indonesian, English	Bachelor in an English program	English Teacher
Dede	24	Sundanese, Javanese, Indonesian, Arabian, English	Bachelor in an business program	English instructor

Mr. Tomo	82	Javanese, Indonesian, English	Post graduate in Plant Pathology Program in the university in The US	Retired lecturer of agricultural program

This study recruited 4 (four) Indonesian participants who were considered as English users. In order to seek their consent, the researcher began with describing the concepts of this research and asked their permission to audio-record their voice, and committed to use pseudonyms (Tina, Sela, Dede, Mr.Tomo). As the researcher has mentioned, Tina (23 years old) has finished her English program at the university and now working at an International company. Sela (23 years old) was also an English Program graduate and working as an English teacher in a private kindergarten school. Dede was studying a business program and he has been recruited as an instructor in an English course. Further, Mr. Tomo (82 years old) had studied Plant Pathology Program in the university in The US and he has retired as a lecturer in a private university.

Data collection

The data were obtained from semi-structured interviews and took 15-20 minutes of each. There were main twelve questions delivered to the respondents. Yet, follow-up questions were offered by considering the participants' engagement. Further, the questions consisted of two functions, such as to gain the information about the experience in using English and their perceptions of using English.

Data Analysis

The interview data were carefully transcribed and analyzed. By combining the top-down and deductive approaches, this data were relied on the themes adopted from Norton and Davins' (2015) model of investment (provided in the literature reviews). In addition, Fishman's (1972) language loyalty was also adopted. In the beginning of the analysis, the attempts to find and highlight the patterns as the preliminary findings were done. Hereafter, the highlighted data were integrated with the concepts used to get the deeper meaning for answering the research questions.

FINDINGS

English speakers' investment

As English users in EFL context, each respondent has experienced each type of investment. Drawing from the Davin and Norton (2015) model of investment, this study found that those participants' investments were generally under the some points, especially in both performing identities and negotiating capitals. Consequently, only limited views of the participants could be interpreted as a maneuvering act into a certain ideology.

Identity

The participants seemed to have their own multiple identities as the foundation of their investment, but they actually own same opportunities to explore and use the target language. Drawing from their races, they have different appearances, e.g. Tina, Sela, and Mr.Tomo are Chinese-like, while Dede is a Javanese-like, but they are in the same position as Indonesian. Further, according to their social status, Mr.Tomo is considered having higher social status than

other respondents, because he had held some important positions when he was working at the university. Yet, they are equivalent as working class persons.

Having the same identity as Indonesian and working people does not guarantee that their investment possess the similarity in opportunities in the future. This is consistent with Norton's (2013) notions person may experience different ideologies, preferences, efforts, and imagined identities. This study found that those participants exactly use English at their working environment as one of the requirements (for Tina, Sela, Dede, and Mr. Tomo).

Excerpt 1: English as the medium of instruction in Tina's and Mr. Tomo's office
Tina: "In my working at X company, all of the staff generally speak English, so I use English (at office).. They are Indonesian, but could speak English. And there are consultants who speak English, but they are nonnative"

Mr.Tomo: Moreover, when I became the dean or the chancellor one when, at that time, there were many foreign staff in the X university, so that I often communicate with those foreign staff, especially who spoke English, such as from America, from Australia, from New Zealand, using English to communicate"

However, ones' desires to invest themselves in using English are dissimilar from one another. Although the data found that the participants' preferences to speak English are limited due to their working spheres, one of the participants (Dede) confidently stated, *"I have a friend, quite close. I just want to know about the culture, [but] if I want to know the culture, automatically, I have to know the language (English), right?"*. His statement is consistent with Norton's (2013) notion that the investment happens, because there is a specific purpose. In short, identity would always accompany the individuals' journeys as English users and it may change anytime based on their own desires.

Negotiating capitals
Participants' desires to invest themselves in learning and using English have been facilitated by their own resources. The resources are their capitals that involve social, cultural and economic capitals. This study found that each participant generally possess those three capital. For the cultural capitals, those participants have sufficient capacities of knowledge to learn language and they own their academic credentials. For example, Mr. Tomo stated that he is linguistically talented and he added that he desire to learn language.

Excerpt 2: Mr. Tomo's cultural capital.
Mr. Tomo: "Fortunately, I can say that I have talent and passion to learn languages. That is why, maybe, this is not really difficult to use English as a daily language "

Further, the participants also indicated that they possess social capitals. Those capitals have been increased by allowing themselves to have a link with "prospective partners" (Darvin & Norton, 2015, p.28). This study discovered that each participant takes possession of his or her own social network, e.g Tina and Mr. Tomo have developed their social capital within their working office (in Excerpt 1), Sela increased her capital through social media and her working sphere *"For English, maybe for making status (on social media). And now in class, because in class I teach English, then this is full English in class"*. Moreover, Dede seemed advancing his social capitals, through communicating with his native friends and his colleagues at his office. He stated, "here (at his office), this regulates us to speak English, so I could not

deny it". In conclusion, those participants could exactly create their own opportunities to develop the capitals to invest into their English learning and use. However, in Indonesia, the spheres may be restricted at schools or working areas. If people expect another achievement in the future, they may draw from their own ideologies to shape their imagined identities as target language users.

Maneuvering ideologies

Ideology is seen as an aspect in which its existence seemed invisible, because of it has mixed with the human's common sense or its instrumentations are concealed (Darvin and Norton, 2015). This is important to understand the ideology that may send individuals into their imagined personality. This study discovers that two respondents could realize their ideologies and clearly showed those as their investment to learn and use English. Tina repeteadly revealed that, "English is a universal language, the main language in the world". In short, her description on English as the universal language has implicated an ideology on globalism. Her measurement on English existence has navigated her understandable patterns of her future, such as she has already shaped a dream to build a bilingual school. She told, *"my dream is simple, I want to build my own school, a bilingual school"*. On the one hand, Dede seemed comprehending the English's position.

Excerpt 3. Dede's ideology maneuver

Dede: We all know that English is one of the international languages. The positive impacts (of learning English) are firstly, honestly, it could be as an additional skill. Then if you could master English, you will get good promotions in working. The you will have many resources to read, such as thesis and English books.

In this case, Dede has reflected an English user disposition. His belief on English has made him to value English not as just a communicative tool, but to enhance his language repertoires and level of work. Thus, not all of the participant could mention their ideology to reflect their ideas that could bring them into certain spaces as target language learners.

Language loyalty

Drawing from the participants responses during the interview session, English has emerged particular impacts that generally will not bring their identity as Indonesian in a danger. For example, Dede stated that having a conversation in English with his native friends has allowed him to follow their authentic cultures. Dede said,"*because of the frequency in having a interaction with people who speak English, and they are native, native American, it make me to follow, like the gestures, jokes, the way we talk*". His connectivity with the native speakers may transform his identity into the new one and enable him to imagine becoming a part of those target language speakers. On the other hand, he also showed his loyalty toward Indonesian. He speaks Indonesian quite often based on the context, such as Indonesian in Jogja or Papua styles. On the one hand, although Tina pointed out her pride of being able to speak English, she still revealed her faithfulness on Bahasa Indonesia. "*Yes, I want people in Indonesia know about English earlier, because it is important to teach. However, we can not ignore Bahasa Indonesia, because we are Indonesian and we should proud of this langauge.*"

Likewise Mr. Tomo, although some important positions that he ever occupied have transmitted him into a deep English usage, but he still attempted to introduce Bahasa Indonesia and Indonesian cultures. He revealed, *"I definitely wanted the foreign staff in Indonesia to not only teach English or teach their teaching subjects, but I also wanted them to learn Bahasa Indonesia as our national language and use it to communicate. And, at least, they could recognize our Indonesian cultures"*. In addition, In general, those participants have an effort to maintain Bahasa Indonesia, though their surroundings and community oblige them to emphasize on the English use.

DISCUSSION

The meaning of being English users

By drawing on the Darvin and Norton's (2015) model of investment, this study could interpret what being English users mean to them. Firstly, being English users is a product caused by identity construction process. Those participants might have their own identities, such as being Indonesian, Javanese, and working persons. However, their identities could be changed and constructed by their surroundings and different opportunities. For example, the two teacher participants have suggested that being English users are limited by the offices' regulation. Further, English users are beyond than utilizing English as a means to fulfill the schools' needs, but it can facilitate the speakers to expose other valuable possibilities. This is consistent with Norton's (2013) notion that identity is "how people understand their relationship to the world, how that relation is constructed across time and space, and how people understand their possibilities for the future" (p. 45).

Secondly, this study sums up that being English users is about being aware of the capitals to promote the investment to learn and use the language. The participants have been positioned themselves into certain quarters that enable them to maximize the capitals and "to fulfill a certain desire" (Darvin & Norton, 2015, p.28). In addition, each participant has the most prominent resources that send her and him into a comfort to use English. Mr. Tomo, as a knowledgeable person, found the ease to acquire English, though he was not majoring English at the university. As a result, this competence had facilitated him to communicate with his foreign colleagues. Hereinafter, Dede's networks with native friends were valued essential as his social resources. Furthermore, those participants were seen having sufficient economic capitals to smoothen their path into the higher education levels to learn deeper about English. As a result, their English capabilities became their provision to enter into their careers and social world.

Thirdly, being English users have navigated their ideologies as the benchmarks to achieve their imagined identities. Some participants, Nana and Dede, could recall their ideologies on globalism, and mostly stating that English was now the most important language in the world. For example, by understanding the importance of English, Nana mentioned that she dreamed to have a bilingual school in the future. On the one hand, though Mr.Tomo and Sela did not literally say on particular ideologies, but by looking at their experiences and ideas on the importance of English, those represented the statements that are not too much different.

The Influences of English

This current study also examined, as English users, to what extend English influences their identities. Based on the data, affected by their social background, their working and their perspectives about English, they differently experienced in deepening English. As a result, some participants' felt influenced by English, but others claimed that it affected nothing.

This study deduced that English does not become the obstacles for them to maintain their Bahasa Indonesia and cultures. Although Dede and Mr. Tomo were not English program graduates, but their exposures to English use seemed beyond Sela and Tina's who have majored this program. Based on the data, because of the frequency in having conversation with his native colleagues, Dede's personality tended to be native-like, e.g his gestures, jokes and the way he talks, but the changing are limited in his appearances. He still maintained the use of Bahasa Indonesia. Further, Tina, Sela and Mr. Tomo's ideological thinking on English as the universal language did not merely change their identities. The pride of being capable to speak English was transformed to be an opportunities to uphold Indonesian language and cultures. These results are relevant to what have been stated by Yeh's (2013) concept on identity constructions that has two major points. Those are categorized as an appropriation, when those participants used English appropriately in their Indonesian ways, and negotiation, when those speakers were aware of the importance of having interconnections with target language speakers in multicultural contexts, without giving effects to their identity existences.

CONCLUSION

This study has examined Indonesians' perspectives as English users. By drawing from Darvin and Norton's model of investment (2015) and Fishman's (1972) theories, this could answer the research questions on the meaning as English users and the effect of English for their identities. Furthermore, this research revealed that, for those participants, being English users means having

a realization of their individual investment in learning and using English. Their kinds and strategies of investment determine their smoothness to reach their imagined identities. In the end, each respondent encounters diverse challenges and opportunities within their social life. Moreover, the present study found that those participants are loyal towards their Bahasa Indonesia and Indonesian cultures. They are confident to introduce those with their foreign colleagues in their office or outside of their working activities. Limitations of this mini study involve (1) lacking of the number of participants as the sufficient sample to represent the whole number of English users in Indonesia and (2) it may be difficult to generalize the findings to be suitable with the Davin and Norton's model of investment.

In addition, this mini research has put forward some pedagogical implications. Firstly, English teachers are recommended to maneuver the students' to be aware of their language leaning progress. This may beneficial for students to recognize their possibilities or resources to advance. Secondly, the authentic target language contexts should also be introduced for the students carefully, so the students could promote the students to create their imagine identities in a good proportion. In this case, the teachers should also familiarize the students with local contexts and cultures. Therefore, teachers may not only depend on the school materials or textbooks, but they could position themselves as the learning resources (Motha & Jain, 2011).

REFERENCES

Bolton, K. (2008). English in asia, asian englishes, and the issue of proficiency. *English Today, 24*(2), 3-12.

Chang, Y. (2014). Learning english today: What can world englishes teach college students in taiwan? *English Today, 30*(1), 21-27.

Darvin, R. & B. Norton (2015). Identity and a model of investment in applied linguistics. *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics, 35*, 35−56.

Fishman, J A. (1972). *Language n Sociocultural Change*. California: Stanford University Press.

Gunantar, D. A. (2016). The impact of english as an international language on english language teaching in indonesia. *Journal lof Language and Literature, 10*(1), 141-151

Harni Kartika-Ningsih, & Rose, D. (2018). Language shift: Analysing language use in multilingual classroom interactions. *Functional Linguistics, 5*(1), 1-22.

Huang, I. (2016). 'Everybody learns english, and so do I': The dominance of english and its effects on individuals. *English Today, 32*(1), 28-34.

Jenkins, J., Cogo, A., & Dewey, M. (2011). Review of developments in research into english as a lingua franca. *Language Teaching, 44*(3), 281-315.

Johnson, A. (2009). The rise of English: The language of globalization in China and the European Union. *Macalester International, 22*(1), 12.

Kankaanranta, A., Louhiala-Salminen, L., & Karhunen, P. (2015). English in multinational companies: Implications for teaching "english" at an international business school. *Journal of English as a Lingua Franca, 4*(1), 125-148.

Kuteeva, M., & Airey, J. (2014). Disciplinary differences in the use of english in higher education: Reflections on recent language policy developments. *Higher Education, 67*(5), 533-549.

Kim, S.L., Siong, K. L., Fei, F. W.,& Ya'Acob, A. 2010. *The english language and its impact on identities of multilingual malaysian undergraduates. Journal of Language Studies, 10*(1), 87-101.

Motha, S., Jain, R.,& Tecle, T. 2011. Translinguistic identity-as-pedagogy: Implications for language teacher education. *International Journal of Innovation in English Language Teaching and Research, 1*(1), 13-28.

Norton, B. (2000). Identity and Language Learning: Gender, Ethnicity and Educational Change. Essex: Pearson.

Norton, B. (2013). *Identity and Language Learning: Extending The Conversation (2nd edn.)*. Bristol: Multilingual Matters.

Roux, P. W. (2014). English as an International Language: The debate continues. *Polyglossia, 26*, 45-56.

Schaller-Schwaner, I. (2015). The habitat factor in ELF(A) - english as a lingua franca (in academic settings) - and english for plurilingual academic purposes. *Language Learning in Higher Education, 5*(2), 329-351.

Le Page, R., & Tabouret-Keller, A. (1985). *Acts of Identity: Creole-Based Approaches to Language and Ethnicity*. Cambridge: CUP.

Torres-Rocha, J. (2017). High school EFL teachers' identity and their emotions towards language requirements. *Profile, 19*(2), 41-55.

Yeh, L. (2013). World englishes and identity construction: A qualitative analysis of two taiwanese EFL undergraduates' viewpoints. *The Asia - Pacific Education Researcher, 22*(3), 327-340.